

Exotic duality and higher spins

Nicolas Boulanger - Physique de l'Univers, Champs et Gravitation, UMONS

Based on [2012.11356](#) (JHEP) in collaboration with [Victor Lekeu](#) (Imperial College London & AEI Potsdam)
and work in collaboration with [Victor Lekeu](#), [Andrea Campoleoni](#) and [Zhenya Skvortsov](#) (UMONS)

June 4 - Quark 2020 online workshops 2021

“Integrability, Holography, Higher-spin Gravity and Strings”

Dedicated to A.D. Sakharov's centennial

Plan of talk

1) Introduction & motivations

2) Results on the double-dual graviton and higher duals of vector field

2.1) Double dualisation of a massless vector in $n=4$: $\square \mapsto \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline \square & \square \\ \hline \end{array}$

2.2) Double dualisation of spin-2 $h_{ab} \sim \square\square$ in $n=5$ into $D \sim \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline \square & \square \\ \hline \end{array}$

3) Higher (or exotic) dualisation of the 3D graviton and scalar \rightarrow spin-3 gauge field

3.1) Higher dualisation of graviton in 3D $\square\square \mapsto \square\square\square$

3.2) Higher dualisation of scalar in 3D $\bullet \mapsto \square\square\square$

① Introduction - motivations

Duality in gravity \rightarrow Hull's works (circa 2000) on $\mathcal{N}_6 = (4,0)$ theory
and simultaneously West's e_n proposal [2001]

\hookrightarrow In these works, a gauge field

$$C_{[n-3,1]} \mapsto C_{a_1 \dots a_{n-3}, b} = C_{[a_1 \dots a_{n-3}], b} \quad \text{s.t.} \quad C_{[a_1 \dots a_{n-3}, b]} \equiv 0$$

i.e. $C_{[n-2,1,1]} \sim \prod_{n-3}^{\square}$ of $GL(n)$ appears in Minkowski spacetime $\mathbb{R}^{1, n-1}$

that propagates the d.o.f. of Fierz-Pauli's graviton h_{ab} s.t. $\eta^{bd} K_{ab, cd}(h) = 0$.

Hull's twisted on-shell duality, relating $K_{a_1 \dots a_{n-2}, b_1 b_2} := \partial_{[a_1} \partial^{[b_1} C_{a_2 \dots a_{n-2}], b_2]}$

to $K_{ab, cd} := -\frac{1}{2} \partial_{[a} \partial^c h^d]_{b]}$ via $K_{[n-2, 2]} = *_1 K_{[2, 2]}$.

In same work [Hull:2001] a field

$$D_{[n-3, n-3]} \sim \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline & \\ \hline n-3 & n-3 \\ \hline \end{array} \text{ of } Gl(n), \quad \xrightarrow{n=5} \quad D_{[2,2]} \sim \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline & \\ \hline & \\ \hline \end{array}$$

was introduced with field equations $\text{Tr}^{n-3} K_{[n-2, n-2]}(D) = 0 \xrightarrow{n=5} \text{Tr}^2 K_{[3,3]} = 0$.

Twisted duality with h_{ab} : $K_{[n-2, n-2]}(D) = *_1 *_2 K_{[2,2]}(h) \xrightarrow{n=5} K_{[3,3]} = *_1 *_2 K_{[2,2]}(h)$.

$$\underline{EII} \quad d_1^+ K_{[2,2]} \equiv 0 \iff d_1 K_{[3,3]} = 0 \iff K_{[3,3]} = d_1 d_2 D_{[2,2]} =: K_{[3,3]}(D) \quad \underline{BII}$$

□ [Dubois-Violette - Henneaux 2000]

But $\text{Tr} K_{[2,2]} = 0 \text{ (EI)} \iff \text{Tr} *_1 *_2 K_{[3,3]} = 0 \iff \text{Tr}^2 K_{[3,3]} = 0 \text{ (EI)}$ EoM for D .

Field equations mapped to Field equations (and not on Bianchi identities).

In presence of sources, Hull argued that $D_{[2,2]}$ couples to the usual T_{ab} stress tensor confirming that $D_{[2,2]}$ is, *on-shell*, an avatar of h_{ab} .

Indeed, from twisted-duality $K_{[3,3]}(\mathbb{D}) = *_1 *_2 K_{[2,2]}(h)$. (*)

$$K_{[3,3]}(\mathbb{D}) = d_1 d_2 \mathbb{D}_{[2,2]} = *_1 *_2 d_1 d_2 h_{[1,1]} \propto \eta_{[1,1]} d_1 d_2 h_{[1,1]} \quad (\text{since } n=5)$$

$$\Leftrightarrow d_1 d_2 (\mathbb{D}_{[2,2]} - a \eta_{[1,1]} h_{[1,1]}) = 0 \quad a \in \mathbb{R}_0$$

$$\Leftrightarrow \mathbb{D}_{[2,2]} = a \eta_{[1,1]} h_{[1,1]} + d^{[2]} \xi_{[2,1]} \quad (**)$$

\Rightarrow When the EoMs for h_{ab} Fierz-Pauli are satisfied (since twisted on-shell duality (*) was used),

then the $\mathbb{D}_{[2,2]}$ -field is conformally flat up to a gauge transformation (**)

[Marc H., Victor Lekeu and Amoury Leonard 1909.12706]

Therefore, inverting (**) to express $h_{[1,1]} = H_{[1,1]}(\text{Tr } \mathbb{D}, \xi)$ and plugging in

$S^{\text{FP}}[H_{ab}(\text{Tr } \mathbb{D}, \xi)]$ gives field equations equivalent to (**).

\Rightarrow The traceless part of $\mathbb{D}_{[2,2]}$ does not enter this action.

However, before [Marc-Victor Arnaury 2019]'s note on the double-dual graviton, an action principle had been proposed for a $D_{[2,2]}$ gauge field (plus other fields) that propagates the degrees of freedom of a single graviton:

N.B, Paul Cook, Mitya Ponomarev [2012]

"Off-shell Hodge dualities in linearized gravity and E_{11} "

- In the paper 2012.11356 with Victor Lekeu, the first thing done was to clarify the non-triviality of the action proposed earlier with P. Cook and D. Ponomarev.

② Results on the double-dual graviton and higher duals of vector field

2.1) Double dualisation of a massless vector [N.B., P. Sundell, P. West 2015]

Idea : A_b viewed as a $A_{[0,1]}$ bi-form

$$A_{[0,1]} \xrightarrow{\substack{\text{double} \\ \text{dualize}}} C_{[n-0-2, n-1-2]} \underset{n=4}{=} C_{[2,1]} \sim \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline & \\ \hline & \\ \hline \end{array} \quad \text{or } n=3 : C_{[1,1]} \sim \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline & \\ \hline & \\ \hline \end{array}$$

• Starts from Maxwell and integrate by part: $S[A_\mu] = -\frac{1}{2} \int d^n x (\partial_a A_b \partial^a A^b - \partial_a A^a \partial_b A^b)$

• Parent action $S[Y^{ab}, P_i] = \int d^n x (P_{ab} \partial_c Y^{cab} - \frac{1}{2} P_{ab} P^{ab} + \frac{1}{2} P^a{}_a P_b{}^b)$

$$\frac{\delta S[Y, P]}{\delta P_{ab}} \approx 0 \Leftrightarrow \partial_c Y^{cab} - P^{ab} + \eta^{ab} P^c{}_c \approx 0 \xrightarrow{\text{Tr}} \partial_c Y^{ca}{}_a + (n-1) P^a{}_a \approx 0 \Leftrightarrow P^a{}_a = \frac{1}{1-n} \partial_c Y^{ca}{}_a$$

$$P^{ab} \approx \partial_c Y^{cab} - \eta^{ab} \frac{1}{n-1} \partial_c Y^{cd}{}_d$$

substitute to get

$$S[P_{ab}] = \int d^n x \left[\frac{1}{2} \partial_c Y^{cab} \partial_d Y^d{}_{ab} - \frac{1}{2(n-1)} \partial_a Y^{ab}{}_b \partial^a Y^{cd}{}_d \right]$$

• From $S[P_{a|b}] = \int d^n x \left[\frac{1}{2} \partial_c \gamma^{ca|b} \partial_d \gamma^d{}_{a|b} - \frac{1}{2(n-1)} \partial_a \gamma^{ab|c} \right]$

invariant under $\delta \gamma^{ab|c} = \delta_c^{[a} \partial^{b]} \lambda + \partial_d \gamma^{abd|c}$,

one decomposes

$$\gamma^{ab|c} = \chi^{ab|c} + \delta_c^{[a} z^{b]}, \quad \chi^{ab|c} = 0$$

and

• Hodge-dualise in $n=4$: $\chi^{ab|c} \leftrightarrow T_{ab|c} \sim \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline a & c \\ \hline b & \\ \hline \end{array}$

with gauge transformations $\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \delta \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline & \\ \hline & \\ \hline \end{array} = \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline s & \\ \hline \partial & \\ \hline \end{array} + \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline & a \\ \hline & \partial \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \delta z_a = \partial_a \lambda + \partial^b A_{ab} \end{array}$

• Hodge-dualise in $n=3$: $\gamma^{ab|c} = \varepsilon^{abd} h_{dc} + z \delta_c^{[a} z^{b]}$,

where $h_{..} \sim \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline \cdot & \cdot \\ \hline \end{array}$ and $\delta h_{ab} = z \partial_a \epsilon_b$, $\delta z_a = \partial_a \lambda + \varepsilon_{abc} \partial^b \epsilon^c$

Ⓐ In dim. $n=3$,

$$S[h_{ab}, z_a] = \int d^3x \left[-\frac{1}{2} \partial_a h_{bc} \partial^a h^{bc} + \frac{1}{2} \partial_a h_{bc} \partial^b h^{ac} + \frac{1}{2} \epsilon^{bcd} \partial^a h_{ab} F_{cd}(z) + \frac{1}{4} F^{ab}(z) F_{ab}(z) \right]$$

where $F_{ab}(z) := 2 \partial_{[a} z_{b]}$ and copy the gauge transformation laws:

$$\delta h_{ab} = 2 \partial_{(a} \epsilon_{b)} \quad , \quad \delta z_a = \partial_a \lambda + \epsilon_{abc} \partial^b \epsilon^c$$

One can dualise z_a vector field into a scalar σ in $n=3$, then define

$$\phi := 2\sigma + \eta^{ab} h_{ab} \quad \text{to obtain}$$

$$S[\phi, h_{ab}] = \int d^3x \left[\mathcal{L}^{\text{FP}}(\partial h) + \frac{1}{2} \partial_a \phi \partial^a \phi + \partial_a \phi (\partial_b h^{ab} - \partial^a h) \right] \quad (\Delta)$$

Field equations \Rightarrow $\text{Tr}^2 K_{[2,2]}(h) = 0 \quad , \quad \square \phi = 0 \quad \& \quad K_{ab}(h) = \partial_a \partial_b \phi$

\Rightarrow No doubling of physical d.o.f.!

Ⓑ In dim. $n=4$, perform some change of field variables and dualize $Z_a \leftrightarrow \tilde{A}_a$

$$S [T_{abc}, \tilde{A}_a] = \int d^4x \left[\mathcal{L}^{\text{curt.}}(T_{ab,c}) + \frac{1}{4} F^{ab}(\tilde{A}) F_{ab}(\tilde{A}) - \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \tilde{A}^a K_a^{\text{TT}}(T) \right]$$

where $K^{a[33]}_{b[22]} := 6 \partial^{[a} \partial_{[b} T^{aa]}_{b]}$ curvature, $K^{\text{TT}} := \text{Tr}^2 K$.

The gauge invariances are the ones expected for a Curtright field and a vector.

• *Field equations:*

$$-\partial_a F^{ab}(\tilde{A}) + \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} K^{\text{TT}b} = 0 \quad (1)$$

$$K^{\text{TT}ab}{}_c + \delta_c^{[a} K^{\text{TT}b]} - \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \partial_c F^{ab} - \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \delta_c^{[a} \partial_d F^{b]d} = 0 \quad (2)$$

Take the trace of (2), combine with (1) to get the EoMs *and duality relation*

$$d^+ F_{[2]}(\tilde{A}) = 0 = \text{Tr}^2 K_{[3,2]}(T) \quad \& \quad \text{Tr} K_{[3,2]}(T) = \frac{1}{2} d_2 F_{[2,0]}(\tilde{A}) \Rightarrow \text{no doubling of d.o.f. !}$$

2.2) Double-dualisation of spin-2 in $n=5$.

The dualization procedure given in [N.B., P. Cook, D. Ponomarev 2012] for the double-dual graviton

gives an action
$$S[D_{ab,cd}, Z^{abc}] = \int d^5x \mathcal{L}(\partial D, \partial Z) \quad , \quad D \sim \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline & \\ \hline & \\ \hline \end{array}$$

$Z^{abc} = -Z^{bac}$

where
$$\mathcal{L}(\partial D, \partial Z) = \mathcal{L}(\partial Z) - \mathcal{L}(\partial D) + \mathcal{L}^{\text{cross}}$$

features the complete $D_{ab,cd}$ field, including its traceless part.

The action is gauge invariant under

$$\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \delta \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline & \\ \hline & \\ \hline \end{array} = \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline & \\ \hline & \partial \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \delta Z^{[mn]a} = \lambda^{[mn]a} + \partial^{[m} \xi^{n]a} - \frac{1}{2} \delta_a^{[m} \partial_b \xi^{n]b} + \delta_a^{[m} \partial^{n]} \chi \end{array} \right.$$

where $\lambda_{abc} = \lambda_{[abc]}$ and $\xi^{ab} \sim \begin{array}{|c|} \hline a \\ \hline \end{array} \otimes \begin{array}{|c|} \hline b \\ \hline \end{array}$

Perform a change of variable

$$y^{ab}{}_c := z^{ab}{}_c + \delta_c^{[a} z^{b]}$$

to get

$$S[y^{ab}{}_c, D_{ab,cd}] = \int d^5x \left[\mathcal{L}^{\text{cur.}}(y^{ab}{}_c) - \mathcal{L}(\partial\mathcal{D}) \right. \\ \left. + \frac{1}{2} \epsilon_{abcde} \partial^e \mathcal{D}^{cd, mn} \left(\overbrace{F^{abmn}}^{3 \partial^{[a} y^{bmn]c}}(y) - \frac{1}{2} F^{mnua} b \right) \right]$$

That propagates a *single graviton*.

Dualize $y^{ab}{}_c$ in $n=5$ ($\epsilon_{abcde} \partial^d f_{[a} F^{bc]e}$) for $f_{abc} \sim h_{ab} + B_{[ab]}$ to get

$$S[D_{ab,cd}, f_{ab}] = \int [\mathcal{L}^{\text{FP}}(h) - \mathcal{L}(\partial\mathcal{D}) - \frac{3}{2} h_{ab} \tilde{K}^{,ab}(\mathcal{D})]$$

where $\tilde{K}_{[2,2]}(\mathcal{D}) := \underbrace{*_1 *_2 d_1 d_2 \mathcal{D}_{[2,2]}}_{K_{[3,3]}}$. Field equations: $\text{Tr } K_{[2,2]}(h) = 0 = \text{Tr}^2 K_{[3,3]}(\mathcal{D})$

& $K_{[2,2]}(h) \propto \text{Tr } K_{[3,3]}(\mathcal{D})$.

③ Higher (or exotic) dualisation of the 3D graviton and scalar

3.1) Higher dualisation of graviton in 3D $\square \square \mapsto \square \square \square \oplus \text{more}$

Spin-2 Fierz-Pauli $\square \square$ viewed as $h_{[0,1,1]}$ gauge field

Curvature $K_{[2,2,1]}(h) \sim \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline & & a \\ \hline \partial & \partial & \\ \hline \end{array} \xrightarrow[*_3]{} \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline & & \\ \hline & & \\ \hline \partial & \partial & \partial \\ \hline \end{array} = \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline & & \\ \hline \partial & \partial & \partial \\ \hline \end{array} = K_{[2,2,2]}(\varphi)$

On-shell Twisted duality

$$*_3 K_{[2,2,1]}(h) = K_{abcd}{}_{1a}(h) \varepsilon^{u}{}_{ef} \sim \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline a & c & e \\ \hline b & d & f \\ \hline \end{array} \stackrel{\text{TD}}{=} K_{abcd}{}_{1ef}(\varphi) := 8 \partial_{[a} \partial_{[c} \partial_{|e} \varphi_{f]d]b]}$$

$$\text{Tr } K_{[2,2,1]}(h) = 0 = \text{Tr } K_{[2,2,2]} \quad (\text{EI})$$

Since $n=3$, (EI) $\Leftrightarrow K_{[2,2,1]}(h) = 0 = K_{[2,2,2]}(\varphi)$ Topological



To make that story variational :

$$1. S_{\text{FP}}[h_{ab}] = \int d^3x \left[-\frac{1}{2} \partial_a h_{bc} \partial^a h^{bc} + \frac{1}{2} \partial_a h \partial^a h - \partial_a h^{ab} \partial_b h + \partial_a h^{ab} \partial^c h_{cb} \right]$$

$$2. S[G_{abc}, D_{ab,cd}] = \int d^3x \left[-\frac{1}{2} G_{abc} G^{abc} + \frac{1}{2} G_{a10} G^{a10} - G_{01}{}^{0b} G_{b1}{}^{0a} + G_{01}{}^{0b} G^{a1ab} + G^{d1}{}_{bc} \partial^a D_{ad}{}^{bc} \right]$$

where $G_{abc} \sim \boxed{a} \otimes \boxed{bc}$, $D_{ad}{}^{bc} \sim \boxed{\frac{a}{d}} \otimes \boxed{bc}$

3. Solve for G_{abc} auxiliary field

$$\hookrightarrow S[D_{ab,cd}] = \frac{1}{2} \int d^3x \left[\partial^a D_{ab}{}^{cd} \partial_a D^{ebcd} - \partial^a D_{0b1c}{}^b \partial_d D^{de1c}{}_e - \partial^a D_{ab1c}{}^c \partial_e D^{eb1d}{}_d \right]$$

$$4. \text{Decompose } \tilde{D}_{abc} := -\frac{1}{2} \epsilon_{am1n} D^{m1n}{}_{bc} \sim \boxed{a} \otimes \boxed{bc} \xrightarrow{\downarrow \text{SO}(3)} \boxed{\quad\quad\quad} \oplus \boxed{\quad\quad} \oplus 2 \times \boxed{\quad}$$

5. Dualise one vector into scalar • , perform some field redefinitions to get ...

$$\begin{aligned}
S[\varphi_{abc}, h_{ab}] = \frac{1}{2} \int d^3x & \left[-\partial_a \varphi_{bcd} \partial^a \varphi^{bcd} + \partial^a \varphi^b \partial^c \varphi_{abc} + \partial_a \varphi^{abc} \partial^d \varphi_{bcd} \right. \\
& - \frac{1}{7} \partial_a \varphi_b \partial^a \varphi^b - \frac{31}{28} \partial_a \varphi^a \partial^b \varphi_b \\
& + \frac{1}{2} \partial_a h_{bc} \partial^a h^{bc} + \frac{1}{14} \partial_a h \partial^a h - \frac{3}{7} \partial^a h_{ab} \partial_c h^{bc} - \frac{1}{7} \partial^a h \partial_c h_a^c \\
& \left. + \frac{10}{7} \varepsilon_{apq} \partial^b h_b^a \partial^p \varphi^q - 2 \varepsilon_{apq} \partial^b h^{ac} \partial^p \varphi^q_{bc} \right] \quad (3.32)
\end{aligned}$$

that is invariant under

$$\delta \varphi_{abc} = 3 \partial_{(a} \widehat{\xi}_{bc)} - \frac{2}{3} \varepsilon_{(a}{}^{pq} \eta_{bc)} \partial_p \epsilon_q, \quad (3.33)$$

$$\delta h_{ab} = 2 \partial_{(a} \epsilon_{b)} + 2 \varepsilon_{pq(a} \partial^p \widehat{\xi}^q_{b)}. \quad (3.34)$$

Recall that this is a *topological* theory.

From a general result [Grigoriev-Mkrtchyan-Shvartsov 2005], we know that

it can be put in Chern-Simons form [To appear]

3.2) Double exotic dualisation of vector in 3D : $\square \mapsto \square\square\square \oplus$ more

Start from the first exotic dualisation of Maxwell's theory in $n=3$

$$S[h_{ab}, Z_a] = \int d^3x \left[-\frac{1}{2} \partial_a h_{bc} \partial^a h^{bc} + \frac{1}{2} \partial_a h_{bc} \partial^b h^{ac} + \frac{1}{2} \epsilon^{abcd} \partial^a h_{ab} F_{cd}(z) + \frac{1}{4} F^{ab}(z) F_{ab}(z) \right]$$

where $\delta h_{ab} = z \partial_a \epsilon_b$, $\delta Z_a = \partial_a \lambda + \epsilon_{abc} \partial^b \epsilon^c$

and dualise $h_{ab} \sim \begin{bmatrix} a & b \end{bmatrix}$ in empty column.

After some steps (parent action, daughter action, $so(3)$ decomposition, field redef.,

dualisation, field redef.), one gets an action $S[\phi_{abc}, h_{ab}, H_a]$

invariant under entangled gauge transformations:

$$\begin{aligned} \delta \phi_{abc} &= 3 \partial_{[a} \hat{\xi}_{bc]} - \frac{2}{3} \epsilon_{ca}{}^{mn} \eta_{bc} \partial_m \epsilon_n \\ \delta h_{ab} &= z \partial_{[a} \epsilon_{b]} + z \epsilon_{mn[a} \partial^m \hat{\xi}{}^n{}_{b]} \\ \delta H_a &= \partial_a \lambda + \epsilon_{abc} \partial^b \epsilon^c \end{aligned}$$

④ Outlook

- In the topological case in 3D, pursuing the higher (exotic) dualisations to produce higher (indecomposable) spin fields, we expect an infinite spectrum of fields of rank $\in \{2, 3, 4, \dots\}$.

↳ It cannot match the well-known Blencowe model, since here we have an indecomposable structure at the level of gauge transformations.

- In the propagating case in 3D, pursuing the higher (exotic) dualisations to produce higher (indecomposable) spin fields, we expect an infinite spectrum of fields of rank $\in \{1, 2, 3, \dots\}$.

- In the case of double-exotic dual of a scalar field in $n=3$, the action

$$S[h_{ab}, \sigma] = \int d^3x \left[-\frac{1}{2} \partial_a h_{bc} \partial^a h^{bc} + \partial_a h^{ab} \partial^c h_{bc} + 2 \partial_a \sigma (\partial^a \sigma + \partial_b h^{ab}) \right]$$

is obtained in [2012.11356], invariant under

$$\delta h_{ab} = 2 \partial_{[a} \epsilon_{b]}, \quad \delta \sigma = -\partial^a \epsilon_a.$$

↳ We now have found a direct relation with the spin-2 triplet system

as studied and discussed in

"Maxwell-like Lagrangians for higher-spins", [A. Campoleoni & D. Francia, 1206.5877]

- In the higher-spin cases, other undecomposable, finite-dimensional representations are expected.